

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

Florence Weng,

CASE NUMBER:

CV 17-4539-MWF (KSx)

Plaintiff

Elizabeth Avalos, Does 1 to 10, inclusive,

**ORDER REMANDING CASE TO
STATE COURT**

Defendant(s).

The Court sua sponte REMANDS this action to the California Superior Court for the County of Los Angeles for lack of subject matter jurisdiction, as set forth below.

“The right of removal is entirely a creature of statute and ‘a suit commenced in a state court must remain there until cause is shown for its transfer under some act of Congress.’”

Syngenta Crop Prot., Inc. v. Henson, 537 U.S. 28, 32 (2002) (quoting Great N. Ry. Co. v. Alexander, 246 U.S. 276, 280 (1918)). Generally, where Congress has acted to create a right of removal, those statutes are strictly construed against removal jurisdiction. Id.; Nevada v. Bank of Am. Corp., 672 F.3d 661, 667 (9th Cir. 2012); Gaus v. Miles, Inc., 980 F.2d 564, 566 (9th Cir. 1992).

Unless otherwise expressly provided by Congress, a defendant may remove “any civil action brought in a State court of which the district courts of the United States have original jurisdiction.” 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a); Dennis v. Hart, 724 F.3d 1249, 1252 (9th Cir. 2013). The removing defendant bears the burden of establishing federal jurisdiction. Abrego Abrego v.

1 Dow Chem. Co., 443 F.3d 676, 682 (9th Cir. 2006); Gaus, 980 F.2d at 566-67. “Under the plain
2 terms of § 1441(a), in order properly to remove [an] action pursuant to that provision, [the
3 removing defendant] must demonstrate that original subject-matter jurisdiction lies in the federal
4 courts.” Syngenta Crop Prot., 537 U.S. at 33. Failure to do so requires that the case be remanded,
5 as “[s]ubject matter jurisdiction may not be waived, and . . . the district court must remand if it
6 lacks jurisdiction.” Kelton Arms Condo. Owners Ass’n v. Homestead Ins. Co., 346 F.3d 1190,
7 1192 (9th Cir. 2003). “If at any time before final judgment it appears that the district court lacks
8 subject matter jurisdiction, the case shall be remanded.” 28 U.S.C. § 1447(c). It is “elementary
9 that the subject matter jurisdiction of the district court is not a waivable matter and may be raised
10 at anytime by one of the parties, by motion or in the responsive pleadings, or *sua sponte* by the
11 trial or reviewing court.” Emrich v. Touche Ross & Co., 846 F.2d 1190, 1194 n.2 (9th Cir. 1988).

12 From a review of the Notice of Removal and the state court records provided, it is evident
13 that the Court lacks subject matter jurisdiction over the instant case, for the following reasons.

14 No basis for federal question jurisdiction has been identified:

15 The Complaint does not include any claim “arising under the Constitution, laws,
16 or treaties of the United States.” 28 U.S.C. § 1331.

17 Removing defendant(s) asserts that the affirmative defenses at issue give rise to
18 federal question jurisdiction, but “the existence of federal jurisdiction depends
19 solely on the plaintiff’s claims for relief and not on anticipated defenses to those
20 claims.” ARCO Envtl. Remediation, L.L.C. v. Dept. of Health and Envtl. Quality,
21 213 F.3d 1108, 1113 (9th Cir. 2000). An “affirmative defense based on federal law”
22 does not “render[] an action brought in state court removable.” Berg v. Leason, 32
23 F.3d 422, 426 (9th Cir. 1994). A “case may not be removed to federal court on the
24 basis of a federal defense . . . even if the defense is anticipated in the plaintiff’s
25 complaint, and even if both parties admit that the defense is the only question truly
26 at issue in the case.” Franchise Tax Bd. v. Constr. Laborers Vacation Tr., 463 U.S.
27 1, 14 (1983).

28 Removing defendant(s) has not alleged facts sufficient to show that the
29 requirements for removal under 28 U.S.C. § 1443 are satisfied. Section 1443(1)
provides for the removal of a civil action filed “[a]gainst any person who is denied
or cannot enforce in the courts of such State a right under any law providing for
the equal civil rights of citizens of the United States” Even assuming that the
removing defendant(s) has asserted rights provided “by explicit statutory

1 enactment protecting equal racial civil rights," Patel v. Del Taco, Inc., 446 F.3d 996,
2 999 (9th Cir. 2006) (citation omitted), defendant(s) has not identified any "state
3 statute or a constitutional provision that purports to command the state courts to
4 ignore the federal rights" or pointed "to anything that suggests that the state court
5 would not enforce [defendant's] civil rights in the state court proceedings." Id.
6 (citation omitted); see also Bogart v. California, 355 F.2d 377, 381-82 (9th Cir.
7 1966) (holding that conclusionary statements lacking any factual basis cannot
8 support removal under § 1443(1)). Nor does § 1443(2) provide any basis for
9 removal, as it "confers a privilege of removal only upon federal officers or agents
10 and those authorized to act with or for them in affirmatively executing duties
11 under any federal law providing for equal civil rights" and on state officers who
12 refuse to enforce discriminatory state laws. City of Greenwood v. Peacock, 384
13 U.S. 808, 824 & 824 n.22 (1966).

14 The underlying action is an unlawful detainer proceeding, arising under and
15 governed by the laws of the State of California.

16 Removing defendant(s) claims that 28 U.S.C. § 1334 confers jurisdiction on this
17 Court, but the underlying action does not arise under Title 11 of the United States
18 Code.

19 Diversity jurisdiction is lacking, and/or this case is not removable on that basis:

20 Every defendant is not alleged to be diverse from every plaintiff. 28 U.S.C. §
21 1332(a).

22 The Complaint does not allege damages in excess of \$75,000, and removing
23 defendant(s) has not plausibly alleged that the amount in controversy requirement
24 has been met. Id.; see Dart Cherokee Basin Operating Co. v. Owens, 135 S. Ct.
25 547, 554 (2014).

26 The underlying unlawful detainer action is a limited civil action that does not
27 exceed \$25,000.

28 Removing defendant(s) is a citizen of California. 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b)(2).



30 Other:

31 IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that this matter be, and hereby is, REMANDED to the Superior
32 Court of California listed above, for lack of subject matter jurisdiction.

33 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

34 Date: June 23, 2017



35 _____
36 _____
37 _____
38 _____
39 _____
40 _____
41 _____
42 _____
43 _____
44 _____
45 _____
46 _____
47 _____
48 _____
49 _____
50 _____
51 _____
52 _____
53 _____
54 _____
55 _____
56 _____
57 _____
58 _____
59 _____
60 _____
61 _____
62 _____
63 _____
64 _____
65 _____
66 _____
67 _____
68 _____
69 _____
70 _____
71 _____
72 _____
73 _____
74 _____
75 _____
76 _____
77 _____
78 _____
79 _____
80 _____
81 _____
82 _____
83 _____
84 _____
85 _____
86 _____
87 _____
88 _____
89 _____
90 _____
91 _____
92 _____
93 _____
94 _____
95 _____
96 _____
97 _____
98 _____
99 _____
100 _____
101 _____
102 _____
103 _____
104 _____
105 _____
106 _____
107 _____
108 _____
109 _____
110 _____
111 _____
112 _____
113 _____
114 _____
115 _____
116 _____
117 _____
118 _____
119 _____
120 _____
121 _____
122 _____
123 _____
124 _____
125 _____
126 _____
127 _____
128 _____
129 _____
130 _____
131 _____
132 _____
133 _____
134 _____
135 _____
136 _____
137 _____
138 _____
139 _____
140 _____
141 _____
142 _____
143 _____
144 _____
145 _____
146 _____
147 _____
148 _____
149 _____
150 _____
151 _____
152 _____
153 _____
154 _____
155 _____
156 _____
157 _____
158 _____
159 _____
160 _____
161 _____
162 _____
163 _____
164 _____
165 _____
166 _____
167 _____
168 _____
169 _____
170 _____
171 _____
172 _____
173 _____
174 _____
175 _____
176 _____
177 _____
178 _____
179 _____
180 _____
181 _____
182 _____
183 _____
184 _____
185 _____
186 _____
187 _____
188 _____
189 _____
190 _____
191 _____
192 _____
193 _____
194 _____
195 _____
196 _____
197 _____
198 _____
199 _____
200 _____
201 _____
202 _____
203 _____
204 _____
205 _____
206 _____
207 _____
208 _____
209 _____
210 _____
211 _____
212 _____
213 _____
214 _____
215 _____
216 _____
217 _____
218 _____
219 _____
220 _____
221 _____
222 _____
223 _____
224 _____
225 _____
226 _____
227 _____
228 _____
229 _____
230 _____
231 _____
232 _____
233 _____
234 _____
235 _____
236 _____
237 _____
238 _____
239 _____
240 _____
241 _____
242 _____
243 _____
244 _____
245 _____
246 _____
247 _____
248 _____
249 _____
250 _____
251 _____
252 _____
253 _____
254 _____
255 _____
256 _____
257 _____
258 _____
259 _____
260 _____
261 _____
262 _____
263 _____
264 _____
265 _____
266 _____
267 _____
268 _____
269 _____
270 _____
271 _____
272 _____
273 _____
274 _____
275 _____
276 _____
277 _____
278 _____
279 _____
280 _____
281 _____
282 _____
283 _____
284 _____
285 _____
286 _____
287 _____
288 _____
289 _____
290 _____
291 _____
292 _____
293 _____
294 _____
295 _____
296 _____
297 _____
298 _____
299 _____
300 _____
301 _____
302 _____
303 _____
304 _____
305 _____
306 _____
307 _____
308 _____
309 _____
310 _____
311 _____
312 _____
313 _____
314 _____
315 _____
316 _____
317 _____
318 _____
319 _____
320 _____
321 _____
322 _____
323 _____
324 _____
325 _____
326 _____
327 _____
328 _____
329 _____
330 _____
331 _____
332 _____
333 _____
334 _____
335 _____
336 _____
337 _____
338 _____
339 _____
340 _____
341 _____
342 _____
343 _____
344 _____
345 _____
346 _____
347 _____
348 _____
349 _____
350 _____
351 _____
352 _____
353 _____
354 _____
355 _____
356 _____
357 _____
358 _____
359 _____
360 _____
361 _____
362 _____
363 _____
364 _____
365 _____
366 _____
367 _____
368 _____
369 _____
370 _____
371 _____
372 _____
373 _____
374 _____
375 _____
376 _____
377 _____
378 _____
379 _____
380 _____
381 _____
382 _____
383 _____
384 _____
385 _____
386 _____
387 _____
388 _____
389 _____
390 _____
391 _____
392 _____
393 _____
394 _____
395 _____
396 _____
397 _____
398 _____
399 _____
400 _____
401 _____
402 _____
403 _____
404 _____
405 _____
406 _____
407 _____
408 _____
409 _____
410 _____
411 _____
412 _____
413 _____
414 _____
415 _____
416 _____
417 _____
418 _____
419 _____
420 _____
421 _____
422 _____
423 _____
424 _____
425 _____
426 _____
427 _____
428 _____
429 _____
430 _____
431 _____
432 _____
433 _____
434 _____
435 _____
436 _____
437 _____
438 _____
439 _____
440 _____
441 _____
442 _____
443 _____
444 _____
445 _____
446 _____
447 _____
448 _____
449 _____
450 _____
451 _____
452 _____
453 _____
454 _____
455 _____
456 _____
457 _____
458 _____
459 _____
460 _____
461 _____
462 _____
463 _____
464 _____
465 _____
466 _____
467 _____
468 _____
469 _____
470 _____
471 _____
472 _____
473 _____
474 _____
475 _____
476 _____
477 _____
478 _____
479 _____
480 _____
481 _____
482 _____
483 _____
484 _____
485 _____
486 _____
487 _____
488 _____
489 _____
490 _____
491 _____
492 _____
493 _____
494 _____
495 _____
496 _____
497 _____
498 _____
499 _____
500 _____
501 _____
502 _____
503 _____
504 _____
505 _____
506 _____
507 _____
508 _____
509 _____
510 _____
511 _____
512 _____
513 _____
514 _____
515 _____
516 _____
517 _____
518 _____
519 _____
520 _____
521 _____
522 _____
523 _____
524 _____
525 _____
526 _____
527 _____
528 _____
529 _____
530 _____
531 _____
532 _____
533 _____
534 _____
535 _____
536 _____
537 _____
538 _____
539 _____
540 _____
541 _____
542 _____
543 _____
544 _____
545 _____
546 _____
547 _____
548 _____
549 _____
550 _____
551 _____
552 _____
553 _____
554 _____
555 _____
556 _____
557 _____
558 _____
559 _____
560 _____
561 _____
562 _____
563 _____
564 _____
565 _____
566 _____
567 _____
568 _____
569 _____
570 _____
571 _____
572 _____
573 _____
574 _____
575 _____
576 _____
577 _____
578 _____
579 _____
580 _____
581 _____
582 _____
583 _____
584 _____
585 _____
586 _____
587 _____
588 _____
589 _____
590 _____
591 _____
592 _____
593 _____
594 _____
595 _____
596 _____
597 _____
598 _____
599 _____
600 _____
601 _____
602 _____
603 _____
604 _____
605 _____
606 _____
607 _____
608 _____
609 _____
610 _____
611 _____
612 _____
613 _____
614 _____
615 _____
616 _____
617 _____
618 _____
619 _____
620 _____
621 _____
622 _____
623 _____
624 _____
625 _____
626 _____
627 _____
628 _____
629 _____
630 _____
631 _____
632 _____
633 _____
634 _____
635 _____
636 _____
637 _____
638 _____
639 _____
640 _____
641 _____
642 _____
643 _____
644 _____
645 _____
646 _____
647 _____
648 _____
649 _____
650 _____
651 _____
652 _____
653 _____
654 _____
655 _____
656 _____
657 _____
658 _____
659 _____
660 _____
661 _____
662 _____
663 _____
664 _____
665 _____
666 _____
667 _____
668 _____
669 _____
670 _____
671 _____
672 _____
673 _____
674 _____
675 _____
676 _____
677 _____
678 _____
679 _____
680 _____
681 _____
682 _____
683 _____
684 _____
685 _____
686 _____
687 _____
688 _____
689 _____
690 _____
691 _____
692 _____
693 _____
694 _____
695 _____
696 _____
697 _____
698 _____
699 _____
700 _____
701 _____
702 _____
703 _____
704 _____
705 _____
706 _____
707 _____
708 _____
709 _____
710 _____
711 _____
712 _____
713 _____
714 _____
715 _____
716 _____
717 _____
718 _____
719 _____
720 _____
721 _____
722 _____
723 _____
724 _____
725 _____
726 _____
727 _____
728 _____
729 _____
730 _____
731 _____
732 _____
733 _____
734 _____
735 _____
736 _____
737 _____
738 _____
739 _____
740 _____
741 _____
742 _____
743 _____
744 _____
745 _____
746 _____
747 _____
748 _____
749 _____
750 _____
751 _____
752 _____
753 _____
754 _____
755 _____
756 _____
757 _____
758 _____
759 _____
760 _____
761 _____
762 _____
763 _____
764 _____
765 _____
766 _____
767 _____
768 _____
769 _____
770 _____
771 _____
772 _____
773 _____
774 _____
775 _____
776 _____
777 _____
778 _____
779 _____
780 _____
781 _____
782 _____
783 _____
784 _____
785 _____
786 _____
787 _____
788 _____
789 _____
790 _____
791 _____
792 _____
793 _____
794 _____
795 _____
796 _____
797 _____
798 _____
799 _____
800 _____
801 _____
802 _____
803 _____
804 _____
805 _____
806 _____
807 _____
808 _____
809 _____
810 _____
811 _____
812 _____
813 _____
814 _____
815 _____
816 _____
817 _____
818 _____
819 _____
820 _____
821 _____
822 _____
823 _____
824 _____
825 _____
826 _____
827 _____
828 _____
829 _____
830 _____
831 _____
832 _____
833 _____
834 _____
835 _____
836 _____
837 _____
838 _____
839 _____
840 _____
841 _____
842 _____
843 _____
844 _____
845 _____
846 _____
847 _____
848 _____
849 _____
850 _____
851 _____
852 _____
853 _____
854 _____
855 _____
856 _____
857 _____
858 _____
859 _____
860 _____
861 _____
862 _____
863 _____
864 _____
865 _____
866 _____
867 _____
868 _____
869 _____
870 _____
871 _____
872 _____
873 _____
874 _____
875 _____
876 _____
877 _____
878 _____
879 _____
880 _____
881 _____
882 _____
883 _____
884 _____
885 _____
886 _____
887 _____
888 _____
889 _____
890 _____
891 _____
892 _____
893 _____
894